

German I

Translations and syntactic judgments provided by #11, March 2005, October 2006

Data collected by: Neal Whitman

Wh combination	MWh	CWh
Complement/complement	•	
Mixed	•	
Adjunct/adjunct	•	•

Mixed cases in detail	MWh	CWh
Adjunct/complement: <i>where</i> (<i>who</i> subj)	•	
Adjunct/complement : <i>where</i> (<i>whom</i> obj)	•	
Adjunct/complement: <i>when</i> (<i>who</i> subj)	•	
Adjunct/complement: <i>when</i> (<i>whom</i> obj)	•	

I. who/what

SP context : Someone tells you, “I saw a friend of yours reading something unusual.”

PL context: You’re the professor in a seminar, and last week each student in your class chose an article to read and report on this week. Now you’re in class, getting ready to hear the various students’ reports.

- a. **wer hat was gelesen**
 who.NOM has what.ACC read
 ‘Who read what?’
 SP and PL OK

[#11 notes that the sentence is ambiguous: *was* can mean “something”; accenting it disambiguates to the MWh question.]

- b. **was hat wer gelesen**
 what.ACC has who.NOM read
 ‘What did who read?’
 SP and PL OK

- c. ***wer und was hat gelesen**
 who.NOM and what.ACC has read
 SP and PL: no

- d. ***was und wer hat gelesen**
 what.ACC and who.NOM has read
 SP and PL: no

II. Who/where

SP context : Someone tells you, “A friend of yours saw Maria in a strange place.”

PL context: You are a police detective investigating the mysterious disappearance of Maria. You are conferring with other investigators on the case, trying to reconstruct Maria’s last known movements from what witnesses have told you.

- a. **wer hat Maria wo gesehen**
who.NOM has Maria where seen
‘Who saw Maria where?’

SP and PL OK

- b. **wo hat wer Maria gesehen**
where has who.NOM Maria seen
‘Where did who see Maria?’

SP: OK

PL: no

- c. ***wer und wo hat Maria gesehen**
who.NOM and where has Maria seen
SP and PL: no

- d. ***wo und wer hat Maria gesehen**
where and who.NOM has Maria seen
SP and PL: no

[#11 notes: SP is grammatical, but only if *wo* is taken as elliptical question, syntactically separate from *wer* question. PL is impossible, since elliptical *wo* seems to ask for a single location.

SP context: Someone tells you, “Maria saw a friend of yours in a strange place.”

PL context: You suspect that Maria is a spy, and are trying to find out who her contacts are by observing whom she meets with during the course of a day. You have a number of people secretly observing her, and are now about to gather whatever information they have about Maria.

- e. **wen hat Maria wo gesehen**
who.ACC has Maria where seen
‘Whom did Maria see where?’

SP and PL OK

- f. **wo hat Maria wen gesehen**
where has Maria who.ACC seen
‘Where did Maria see whom?’

SP and PL OK

[#11 notes: In above two questions, the second wh word is the one that is of greater interest.]

- g. ***wen und wo hat Maria gesehen**
who.ACC and where has Maria seen
SP OK, but only with *wo* as elliptical question, as above.
PL: no

- h. ***wo und wen hat Maria gesehen**
where and who.ACC has Maria seen
SP and PL: no

III. who/when

SP context: Someone tells you, “A friend of yours saw Maria at the worst possible moment.”

PL context: You are a police detective investigating the mysterious disappearance of Maria. You are conferring with other investigators on the case, trying to reconstruct Maria’s last known movements from what witnesses have told you.

a. **wer hat Maria wann gesehen**

who.NOM has Maria when seen

‘Who saw Maria when?’

SP and PL OK

b. **wann hat wer Maria gesehen**

when has who.NOM Maria seen

‘When did who see Maria?’

SP: OK

PL: no

c. ***wer und wann hat Maria gesehen**

who.NOM and when has Maria seen

SP and PL: no

d. ***wann und wer hat Maria gesehen**

when and who.NOM has Maria seen

SP grammatical , but only with *wann* as elliptical question, as above.

PL: no

e. **wen hat Maria wann gesehen**

who.ACC has Maria where seen

‘Whom did Maria see when?’

SP and PL OK

f. **wann hat Maria wen gesehen**

where has Maria who.ACC seen

‘When did Maria see whom?’

SP and PL OK

g. ***wen und wann hat Maria gesehen**

who.ACC and when has Maria seen

SP and PL: no

h. ***wann und wen hat Maria gesehen**

when and who.ACC has Maria seen

SP and PL: no

IV. where/when

SP context: Someone tells you that your favorite performer, the famous singer Maria, is performing in town for one night only.

PL context: Someone tells you that your favorite music group, the Rolling Stones, are going on a concert tour this summer.

- a. wo {wird Maria / werden die Rolling Stones} wann spielen**
where {will Maria / will the Rolling Stones} when play
'Where will Maria/the Rolling Stones play when?'
SP: ??
PL: ??
- b. wann {wird Maria / werden die Rolling Stones} wo spielen**
where {will Maria / will the Rolling Stones} when play
'When will Maria/the Rolling Stones play where?'
SP and PL OK
- c. wo und wann {wird Maria / werden die Rolling Stones} spielen**
where and when {will Maria / will the Rolling Stones} play
'Where and when will Maria/the Rolling Stones play?'
SP and PL OK
- d. wann und wo {wird Maria / werden die Rolling Stones} spielen**
when and where {will Maria / will the Rolling Stones} play
'When and where will Maria/the Rolling Stones play?'
SP and PL OK

[As in part II, the second of the coordinated wh words is the one of greater interest.]

German II

Translations and syntactic judgments provided by #19, November 2006

Data collected by: Neal Whitman

General notes: Done with contexts listed at top.

Wh combination	MWh	CWh
Complement/complement	•	
Mixed	•	
Adjunct/adjunct	•	•

Mixed cases in detail	MWh	CWh
Adjunct/complement: <i>where</i> (<i>who</i> subj)	•	
Adjunct/complement : <i>where</i> (<i>whom</i> obj)	•	
Adjunct/complement: <i>when</i> (<i>who</i> subj)	•	
Adjunct/complement: <i>when</i> (<i>whom</i> obj)	•	?

I. who/what

SP context : Someone tells you, “I saw a friend of yours reading something unusual.”

PL context: You’re the professor in a seminar, and last week each student in your class chose an article to read and report on this week. Now you’re in class, getting ready to hear the various students’ reports.

a. **wer hat was gelesen**
 who.NOM has what.ACC read
 ‘Who read what?’
 SP and PL OK

b. **was hat wer gelesen**
 what.ACC has who.NOM read
 ‘What did who read?’
 SP and PL OK

Marked, but OK, with either SP or PL

c. ***wer und was hat gelesen**
 who.NOM and what.ACC has read
 SP OK; PL ?, marked

d. ***was und wer hat gelesen**
 what.ACC and who.NOM has read
 SP ?; PL no

II. Who/where

SP context : Someone tells you, “A friend of yours saw Maria in a strange place.”

PL context: You are a police detective investigating the mysterious disappearance of Maria. You are conferring with other investigators on the case, trying to reconstruct Maria’s last known movements from what witnesses have told you.

- a. **wer hat Maria wo gesehen**
who.NOM has Maria where seen
‘Who saw Maria where?’

SP and PL OK

- b. **wo hat wer Maria gesehen**
where has who.NOM Maria seen
‘Where did who see Maria?’

SP ?,

PL: yes, but marked

- c. ***wer und wo hat Maria gesehen**
who.NOM and where has Maria seen

SP and PL: no

- d. ***wo und wer hat Maria gesehen**
where and who.NOM has Maria seen

SP: ?

PL: *

[#19 notes: Unquestionably grammatical only if *wo* is taken as elliptical question, syntactically separate from *wer* question.]

SP context: Someone tells you, “Maria saw a friend of yours in a strange place.”

PL context: You suspect that Maria is a spy, and are trying to find out who her contacts are by observing whom she meets with during the course of a day. You have a number of people secretly observing her, and are now about to gather whatever information they have about Maria.

- e. **wen hat Maria wo gesehen?**
who.ACC has Maria where seen
‘Whom did Maria see where?’

SP and PL OK

- f. **wo hat Maria wen gesehen**
where has Maria who.ACC seen
‘Where did Maria see whom?’

SP and PL OK

- g. ***Wen und wo hat Maria gesehen?**
who.ACC and where has Maria seen

SP grammatical , but only with *wo* as elliptical question, as above. PL impossible.

- h. ***Wo und wen hat Maria gesehen?**
where and who.ACC has Maria seen

Only grammatical if *wo* is taken as elliptical question, syntactically separate from *wer* question.

III. who/when

SP context: Someone tells you, "A friend of yours saw Maria at the worst possible moment."

PL context: You are a police detective investigating the mysterious disappearance of Maria. You are conferring with other investigators on the case, trying to reconstruct Maria's last known movements from what witnesses have told you.

- a. **wer hat Maria wann gesehen**
who.NOM has Maria when seen
'Who saw Maria when?'
SP and PL OK
- b. **wann hat wer Maria gesehen**
when has who.NOM Maria seen
'When did who see Maria?'
SP: OK
PL: ??
- c. ***wer und wann hat Maria gesehen**
who.NOM and when has Maria seen
SP and PL: no
- d. **wann und wer hat Maria gesehen**
when and who.NOM has Maria seen
SP: ?
PL: *

[#19 notes: Unquestionably grammatical only if *wann* is taken as elliptical question, syntactically separate from *wer* question.]

- e. **wen hat Maria wann gesehen**
who.ACC has Maria where seen
'Whom did Maria see when?'
SP and PL OK
- f. **wann hat Maria wen gesehen**
when has Maria who.ACC seen
'When did Maria see whom?'
SP and PL OK
- g. ***wen und wann hat Maria gesehen**
who.ACC and when has Maria seen
SP: no
PL: OK
- h. ***wann und wen hat Maria gesehen**
when and who.ACC has Maria seen
SP: no
PL: OK

[#19 notes: Unquestionably grammatical only if *wann* is taken as elliptical question, syntactically separate from *wen* question.]

IV. where/when

SP context: Someone tells you that your favorite performer, the famous singer Maria, is performing in town for one night only.

PL context: Someone tells you that your favorite music group, the Rolling Stones, are going on a concert tour this summer.

a. wo hat Maria wann gesungen
where has Marie when sung
'Where will Maria/the Rolling Stones play when?'

SP and PL OK

b. wann hat Marie wo gesungen
when has Marie where sung
'When did Marie sing where?'

SP and PL OK

c. wo und wann hat Marie gesungen
where and when has Marie sung
'Where and when did Marie sing?'

SP and PL OK

d. wann und wo hat Marie gesungen
when and where has Marie sung
'When and where did Marie sing?'

SP and PL OK